



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	American Journal of Experimental Agriculture
Manuscript Number:	2013_AJEA_5322
Title of the Manuscript:	Synergistic interaction of sublethal doses of 2,4-D and glufosinate on glyphosate-resistant <i>Amaranthus palmeri</i>

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The manuscript is much improved but still needs addition work before it can be approved. The authors need to proof read their work better before re-submitting. Citations are mis-numbered and not in correct order. Additional comments below. Methodology... explain 12 GR-A palmeri populations Results... what does 'practically' mean? Be more specific L35...replace 'with' with 'having' L36...at the 1st use of an abbreviation use the complete phrase and put the abbreviation in () after L38...use glyphosate primarily for.... L52...Resistance is also promoted by L76...[21], where is citation [24]?? L78...on the efficacy or the.... delete ',' L101...see L36 comment L103...death) relative to the nontreated check L114-115...so what is the 1X and 2X rates of these herbicide s? Confusing. Reword. L117-121...why did you expect that A. plameri would be sensitive to tembotrione? Citations? Observations? Also, show explanation behind reasoning for 2,4-D and dicamba. L145...1x (0.73 kg ai/ha). L162-163...Spraying Systems name and address given on L100, so is it necessary to repeat? L172-176... citation [29]? L186-187...ranging from 14-99% L189-190...but were highly injured to produce seed (what does this statement mean?) L191...30% (Where is this number?) L195...some readers may not know what 'run' means, use another term L197-198..full dose of tembotrione killed 49 to 98% (you can not have an average of 49-99%, maybe a range of 49-98%) L200...where are citations 29-31? L201..at the 1x dose of tembotrione, STF-B... L217-219...add citations for plant size and environmental differences L246...still need to run stats and put NS (not significant) in appropriate columns L247...1x dose of 2,4-D L271...range of 80-99% L273...the 2x dose of dicamba did not kill all plants in any population. L274...Mortality with the 1x dose of dicamba ranged.... L294-298...add citations for these statements L297...has RH been used previously? If not, then need to add 'relative humidity' L300...Anderson is not citation [45] L302-305...add citations L327...glufosinate alone at the 1x dose controlled... L330...not citation [28]	GR was spelled out. The statement was revised; specific numbers were reported. L35 – replaced L36 – changed L38 – changed L52 – changed L76 – citation corrected L78 – deleted L101 – changed L103 – phrase added L114-115 All the rates mentioned are 1x doses L117-121 No longer applicable. Only 1x data are reported. L145 – changed L162-163 Source of nozzles deleted. L172 – 176 Citation number corrected. L189-187 data range corrected L191 – corrected L195 – changed to repetition L197-198 Reworded L200 – citation numbers corrected L201 – reworded L217-219 The following sentences citing references 34, 35, and 36 pertain to size & environmental differences. L246 – NS L247 – done L271 – changed L273 – no longer applicable L274 – Statement was added at the beginning of the dicamba x glyphosate interaction section. L294-298 citations added L297 RH has been used previously L300 – citation number corrected L302-305 citation added L327 – phrase added L330 – citation number corrected



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

L345...Such mixtures should... L351...Under field conditions, the full dose of dicamba... L361...delete '4 to 7% points' L363-366..citation? L367...Burke is not citation 46. Need to go back through manuscript and make sure citations are properly numbered! L373...again, wrong citation	L345 – changed L351 - Phrase added L361 – deleted L363-366 the general weakness of glufosinate on annual grasses relative to glyphosate is common observation; no specific published information. L367, L373 – citation numbers corrected
---	---